2A Evidence: Rohingya

By “Coach Vance” Trefethen

***Resolved:* *The United States federal government should substantially reduce its restrictions on legal immigration to the United States.***

Case Summary: The Rohingya are an ethnic and religious minority group living in a region of Myanmar (also known as Burma). They have been relentlessly persecuted by the government, stripped of their citizenship, killed and chased out of their villages, and rejected by other nations when seeking asylum. Many end up in camps in Bangladesh, where conditions are terrible and the poor Bangladeshis cannot afford to feed them. The Trump administration has lowered the number of Rohingyas being allowed to enter the US as refugees, a terrible policy that needs to be reversed. Resettlement in safe places, like the US, is the only workable solution to the Rohingyas' plight, since their own country rejects them and neighboring countries cannot care for them.

2A Evidence: Rohingya 2

INHERENCY 2

Reform within Myanmar won't happen: Everyone hates the Rohingya 2

Current US policy is repatriation 2

US blocking resettlement here, giving aid instead. But it's not enough, we need to accept more refugees 2

Regional countries' efforts and US aid are not enough. We need a more comprehensive response 2

A/T "Stay in Bangladesh" – That's only temporary, it's a humanitarian crisis and they need to move elsewhere 3

A/T "Stay in Bangladesh" – Rohingyas are resented in Bangladesh due to overwhelming numbers and economic impact 3

A/T "Stay in Bangladesh" – Bangladesh is overwhelmed by the crisis 3

1) UN isn't involved. 2) Refugee repatriation back to Myanmar isn't a good option 3

Repatriation isn't the answer – serious security concerns if they return to Myanmar/Burma 3

Returning to Myanmar is a fantasy – not safe. Must relocate them permanently elsewhere 4

A/T "Aung San Suu Kyi has a plan to repatriate Rohingyas" – It won't work 4

Aung San Suu Kyi can't or won't do much to help Rohingyas 4

HARMS / SIGNIFICANCE 4

Rohingyas are victims of genocide and crimes against humanity 4

Horrific atrocities committed on Rohingyas in Myanmar, and 1.1 million people displaced 5

Loss of human rights and internal displacement in Myanmar 5

Refugee camps are dangerous and deadly – full of starvation and disease 5

SOLVENCY / ADVOCACY 5

Resettlement to a stable country is the only solution 5

UN High Commission for Refugees says US should admit more Rohingyas, despite Trump's resistance 6

Works Cited: Rohingya 7

2A Evidence: Rohingya

INHERENCY

Reform within Myanmar won't happen: Everyone hates the Rohingya

Andrew Buncombe 2017 (journalist) 27 Oct 2017 Rohingya crisis: Death toll of Muslims killed by Burmese army 'may be extremely high', says UN <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/rohingya-crisis-death-toll-burma-army-rakhine-muslims-un-myanmar-a8022931.html>

Speaking to reporters at the United Nations on Thursday, UN investigator Yanghee Lee of South Korea, a leading child rights expert appointed to her United Nations human rights post in 2014, highlighted the growing frustration over what is happening in Burma. “There is so much hatred and hostility against the Rohingya” in Burma, that few dare speak out against it, she said.

Current US policy is repatriation

South China Morning Post 2017. Myanmar must resettle Rohingya in their villages, says US official 4 Nov 2017 <http://www.scmp.com/news/asia/southeast-asia/article/2118437/myanmar-must-resettle-rohingya-their-villages-says-us>

The US wants Myanmar to repatriate hundreds of thousands of Rohingya in their own villages following their exodus from the country’s violence-wracked Rakhine state for Bangladesh, a senior State Department official said on Saturday in Dhaka. Simon Henshaw, acting US assistant secretary of state who visited refugee camps in southeast Bangladesh, said Myanmar should also punish those who committed atrocities in Rakhine.

US blocking resettlement here, giving aid instead. But it's not enough, we need to accept more refugees

Samantha Michaels 2017 (journalist) MOTHER JONES 29 Sept 2017 Refugees Fleeing Ethnic Cleansing in Burma Are About to Get Even Less Help From the US <https://www.motherjones.com/politics/2017/09/refugees-fleeing-ethnic-cleansing-in-burma-are-about-to-get-even-less-help-from-the-us/>

The United States recently pledged [nearly $32 million](https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2017/09/274283.htm) in humanitarian aid to the Rohingya in Burma and Bangladesh. “The images of the violence and its victims have shocked the American people and decent people all over the world,” Vice President Mike Pence [told](https://www.whitehouse.gov/the-press-office/2017/09/20/remarks-vice-president-un-security-council) the UN Security Council last week, calling for “strong and swift action to bring this crisis to an end.” But the administration’s threats to lower refugee admissions have drawn sharp rebuke. “Whether Rohingya refugees or ‘Syrian babies,’ this administration’s claims of concern ring hollow when paired with the stifling of one of its most effective means of rescuing and reinventing lives: resettlement,” [says](https://www.rescue.org/press-release/irc-responds-reports-record-low-presidential-determination) Said Hans Van de Weerd, vice president of US programs at the International Rescue Committee, which helps resettle refugees in the United States.

Regional countries' efforts and US aid are not enough. We need a more comprehensive response

Amanda Catanzano & Nazanin Ash 2017. (Catanzano is the[International Rescue Committee](https://help.rescue.org/)'s senior director for international programs policy and advocacy. Ash is the vice president of public policy and advocacy.) CNN The US must take a lead in the Rohingya crisis 20 Nov 2017 <https://www.cnn.com/2017/11/20/opinions/us-needs-to-lead-on-rohingya-crisis-opinion/index.html>

Third, while poor nations continue to bear the overwhelming brunt of the world's refugee caseload, wealthy nations are simultaneously stepping back from their commitments to resettle the most vulnerable refugees. Although Tillerson notably announced an additional $47 million while visiting Myanmar this week, the crisis requires both greater aid and a more comprehensive response.

A/T "Stay in Bangladesh" – That's only temporary, it's a humanitarian crisis and they need to move elsewhere

Kane Farabaugh 2017 (journalist with Voice of America news) 6 Oct 2017 Tensions Follow Rohingya Refugees to United States <https://www.voanews.com/a/tensions-follow-rohingya-refugees-to-united-states/4059082.html>

More than 500,000 Muslim Rohingya like her have fled Myanmar in the wake of a brutal military crackdown that a top United Nations human rights official calls “ethnic cleansing.” It has fueled a humanitarian crisis as hundreds of thousands of Rohingya seek refuge in camps in neighboring Bangladesh, while waiting to be resettled in another country.

A/T "Stay in Bangladesh" – Rohingyas are resented in Bangladesh due to overwhelming numbers and economic impact

WALL STREET JOURNAL 2018 (journalist Karan D. Singh) 8 Feb 2018 Rohingya Refugees Driven From Myanmar Meet Hostility in Bangladesh <https://www.wsj.com/articles/rohingya-refugees-driven-from-myanmar-meet-hostility-in-bangladesh-1518085800>

Makeshift tent cities, overflowing with Rohingya families fleeing violence in neighboring Myanmar, crowd the muddy hills around this Bangladeshi market town. More than 700,000 refugees have packed into camps here since last year, dwarfing the local population and triggering an increasingly angry response from Bangladeshis who say the influx is causing food shortages, pushing up prices and undercutting wages.

A/T "Stay in Bangladesh" – Bangladesh is overwhelmed by the crisis

Feliz Solomon 2017 (journalist) TIME magazine, 23 Nov 2017 "Myanmar's Crisis, Bangladesh's Burden: Among the Rohingya Refugees Waiting for a Miracle" <http://time.com/5031342/bangladesh-myanmar-rohingya-refugee-crisis/> (brackets added)

Itself a poor country and one of the world’s most densely populated, Bangladesh is home to some 163 million people in a space the size of the U.S. state of Georgia. While this overburdened country has shown remarkable generosity, compassion may fade as the country’s scant resources are diverted to people who aren’t its nationals. “Bangladesh is on the verge of unprecedented crisis,” [Bangladesh President] Hasina [told lawmakers](http://www.thedailystar.net/rohingya-crisis/bangladesh-verge-unprecedented-crisis-over-rohingya-issue-pm-prime-minister-sheikh-hasina-1491607) on Nov. 15, according to the local news website Daily Star, adding that “today’s problem has been created by Myanmar authorities and Myanmar has to solve it.”

1) UN isn't involved. 2) Refugee repatriation back to Myanmar isn't a good option

CNN 2018. (journalist Euan McKirdy) 17 Jan 2018 " Concerns over 'premature' plan to repatriate Rohingya refugees" <https://www.cnn.com/2018/01/17/asia/bangladesh-myanmar-rohingya-repatriation-plan-intl/index.html>

"With memories of rape, killing and torture still fresh in the minds of Rohingya refugees, plans for their return to Myanmar are alarmingly premature," James Gomez, Amnesty International's Regional Director for Southeast Asia and the Pacific, said in a statement. The UN, which has called the bloodshed ethnic cleansing, said its refugee body was not closely involved with the repatriation process and urged both countries to make sure the mainly Muslim Rohingya refugees return voluntarily.

Repatriation isn't the answer – serious security concerns if they return to Myanmar/Burma

CNN 2018. (journalist Euan McKirdy) 17 Jan 2018 " Concerns over 'premature' plan to repatriate Rohingya refugees" <https://www.cnn.com/2018/01/17/asia/bangladesh-myanmar-rohingya-repatriation-plan-intl/index.html>

Wakar Uddin, the US-based Director General of the Arakan Rohingya Union, a non-profit group representing various Rohingya organizations worldwide, said that he had reservations about about the safety of Rohingya once they've returned to Myanmar. "It is a bad deal because the refugees are going to be transferred from one camp from Bangladesh to another camp in Burma, where there will be serious security concerns," he said, using another name for Myanmar.

Returning to Myanmar is a fantasy – not safe. Must relocate them permanently elsewhere

*Jeff Goodson 2017 (retired U.S. foreign service officer, 29-years) 7 Dec 2017 THE HILL* Resettle the Rohingya refugees where they can have a real future Resettle the Rohingya refugees where they can have a real future <http://thehill.com/opinion/international/363833-resettle-the-rohingya-refugees>

If the international community really wants to do something constructive about the crisis, it will stop debating semantics and focus on permanently resettling the Rohingya refugees. The alternative — their “safe, voluntary, dignified and sustainable [return](https://guardian.ng/news/myanmar-to-take-back-rohingya-from-latest-influxes-only/)” to Burma, based on the recommendations of Kofi Annan’s [Rakhine Advisory Commission](http://www.rakhinecommission.org/the-final-report/) — is a fantasy. The commission, established in 2016 by the Burmese government after earlier Rohingya insurgent attacks, is an object lesson in crisis management malpractice.

A/T "Aung San Suu Kyi has a plan to repatriate Rohingyas" – It won't work

Patrick Wintour 2017 (diplomatic editor) THE GUARDIAN 13 Oct 2017 Aung San Suu Kyi unveils relief plans for Rohingya Muslims <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/oct/13/aung-san-suu-kyi-unveils-relief-plans-for-rohingya-muslims-myanmar>

Aung San Suu Kyi listed repatriation of those who have fled to Bangladesh as a top priority, a task that faces political and practical hurdles, notably due to the fact that tens of thousands of Muslim refugees who fled to Bangladesh do not have the documentation likely to satisfy the military that they have a right of return. However, detailed work remains on possible forms of new registration to allow the Rohingya to return.

Aung San Suu Kyi can't or won't do much to help Rohingyas

Amulya Shankar 2017 (journalist) Public Radio International 12 Sept 2017 Aung San Suu Kyi's silence on Rohingya ethnic cleansing could be political pragmatism <https://www.pri.org/stories/2017-09-12/aung-san-suu-kyis-silence-rohingya-ethnic-cleansing-could-be-political-pragmatism>

When her party gained power in 2015, there was a sense that Suu Kyi’s leadership would move the country forward. But her [reputation has been tarnished](https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/mar/31/aung-san-suu-kyi-myanmars-great-hope-fails-to-live-up-to-expectations?CMP=share_btn_tw) by reports of the Myanmar military's violent campaign against the Rohingya ethnic minority in the country. Thousands of Rohingyas have been killed, and [more than a third](https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/sep/12/bangladesh-sheikh-hasina-calls-on-myanmar-to-take-back-rohingya-refugees) of the population has fled to Bangladesh. Suu Kyi has not spoken out against what the United Nations is calling ethnic cleansing, which has incited outrage from the international community and calls for her Nobel Prize to be revoked. Instead, critics say Suu Kyi’s office has [pushed negative theories](http://yangon.sites.unicnetwork.org/2017/01/20/end-of-mission-statement-by-special-rapporteur-on-the-situation-of-human-rights-in-myanmar/) about the Rohingya people and that it [accused international aid workers](http://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/aug/28/aung-sang-suu-kyis-office-accuses-aid-workers-of-helping-terrorists-in-myanmar) of helping "terrorists." One explanation for Suu Kyi’s silence is political pragmatism, says Poppy McPherson, a journalist based in Southeast Asia. Suu Kyi shares power with the military, and the Buddhist majority in Myanmar largely dismisses the plight of Rohingya Muslims, calling them “illegal immigrants” from Bangladesh.

HARMS / SIGNIFICANCE

Rohingyas are victims of genocide and crimes against humanity

*Jeff Goodson 2017 (retired U.S. foreign service officer, 29-years) 7 Dec 2017 THE HILL* Resettle the Rohingya refugees where they can have a real future Resettle the Rohingya refugees where they can have a real future <http://thehill.com/opinion/international/363833-resettle-the-rohingya-refugees>

The Organization of Islamic States declared the crackdown [ethnic cleansing](https://asia.nikkei.com/Politics-Economy/International-Relations/Myanmar-envoy-dismisses-Rohingya-ethnic-cleansing-allegations). [Turkey](https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/sep/02/erdogan-accuses-myanmar-of-genocide-against-rohingya) and [Malaysia](https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/dec/04/malaysia-pm-urges-world-to-act-against-genocide-of-myanmars-rohingya) called it genocide, Amnesty International called it [apartheid](https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2017/11/myanmar-rohingya-trapped-in-dehumanising-apartheid-regime/), and [Iran](https://sputniknews.com/analysis/201709211057593112-iran-rohingya-muslims-myanmar/) compared it to the Hutu genocide that [killed 800,000](http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-13431486) in Rwanda in 1994. Not to be outdone, the U.N. Human Rights Council overwhelmingly approved a resolution saying that [crimes against humanity](https://www.apnews.com/45020fba45ab470b954b27fa27c2cfd5/UN:-Myanmar's-Rohingya-likely-faced-crimes-against-humanity) have “very likely” occurred. Human rights chief Zeid objected, arguing it didn’t go far enough.

Horrific atrocities committed on Rohingyas in Myanmar, and 1.1 million people displaced

Feliz Solomon 2017 (journalist) TIME magazine, 23 Nov 2017 "Myanmar's Crisis, Bangladesh's Burden: Among the Rohingya Refugees Waiting for a Miracle" <http://time.com/5031342/bangladesh-myanmar-rohingya-refugee-crisis/>

When Bangladesh’s borders yielded to the mass of desperate people pouring in from Myanmar in late August, no one predicted the scale of the crisis to come. In the weeks that followed, almost the entire Rohingya population — estimated at 1.1 million inside Myanmar — sought sanctuary as homes and villages went up in flames. Every imaginable horror has been described by those who made it out alive; witnesses said soldiers slaughtered civilians, raped the women, tortured the elderly and burned children to death as they screamed for mercy.

Loss of human rights and internal displacement in Myanmar

Feliz Solomon 2017 (journalist) TIME magazine, 23 Nov 2017 "Myanmar's Crisis, Bangladesh's Burden: Among the Rohingya Refugees Waiting for a Miracle" <http://time.com/5031342/bangladesh-myanmar-rohingya-refugee-crisis/>

Those who remained in Myanmar lived in ever-deteriorating conditions; restrictions on travel, social services and employment [amounted to apartheid](http://time.com/5031278/myanmar-rohingya-amnesty-international-apartheid/), and worsened after deadly riots tore across the state in 2012. Security was then used as a pretext to further isolate them as aid stopped flowing, trade was discontinued and civil servants were no longer deployed to staff Muslim schools and clinics. More than 100,000 have been trapped for years in camps for the internally displaced near the state capital Sittwe, where tens of thousands became so desperate they fled on boats manned by human traffickers, [many dying namelessly](http://time.com/3908627/burmas-nowhere-people/) in the Andaman Sea.

Refugee camps are dangerous and deadly – full of starvation and disease

Feliz Solomon 2017 (journalist) TIME magazine, 23 Nov 2017 "Myanmar's Crisis, Bangladesh's Burden: Among the Rohingya Refugees Waiting for a Miracle" <http://time.com/5031342/bangladesh-myanmar-rohingya-refugee-crisis/>

Standing atop a hill in the very center of this 10 square mile encampment, flimsy huts canvass the landscape in all directions. It’s a city of sorts, but devoid of all infrastructure, with a population comparable to that of Washington, D.C. Of that population, about 60% are children. A recent survey carried out by the French NGO Action Against Hunger (ACF) found that 7.5% of those children suffer from severe acute malnutrition. About 40,000 of those children are imminently at risk of starvation. The ones who are under six months old, of which there are many, are ten times as likely to die. Those who live long enough to be treated for malnutrition are still vulnerable to other things that can kill them, like diarrhea. Or cholera. Or measles. Or wild elephants.

SOLVENCY / ADVOCACY

Resettlement to a stable country is the only solution

*Jeff Goodson 2017 (retired U.S. foreign service officer, 29-years) 7 Dec 2017 THE HILL* Resettle the Rohingya refugees where they can have a real future Resettle the Rohingya refugees where they can have a real future <http://thehill.com/opinion/international/363833-resettle-the-rohingya-refugees>

It’s time to end the Rohingya insurgency for good, stop the recurring humanitarian crises, and close off western Burma permanently as a potential gateway for Islamic jihad. Whatever the fate of the few hundred thousand Rohingya still remaining in Burma, the international community should stop setting its hair on fire and focus on doing what it does best: help resettle the Rohingya refugees to countries where they can have a real future.

UN High Commission for Refugees says US should admit more Rohingyas, despite Trump's resistance

Reuters news service 2017. " U.N. wants to negotiate with U.S., Canada to resettle Rohingya refugees" 16 Feb 2017 <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-myanmar-rohingya-bangladesh/u-n-wants-to-negotiate-with-u-s-canada-to-resettle-rohingya-refugees-idUSKBN15V1OJ>

Tens of thousands of Rohingya live in Bangladesh after fleeing Buddhist-majority Myanmar since the early 1990s, and their number has been swelled by an estimated 69,000 escaping an army crackdown in northern Rakhine State in recent months. The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) would push for resettlement of those most in need, despite growing resistance in some developed countries, particularly the United States under President Donald Trump, UNHCR’s Bangladesh representative, Shinji Kubo, told Reuters on Thursday. “UNHCR will continue to work with the authorities concerned, including in the United States,” Kubo said.